

STATE OF WASHINGTON OFFICE OF THE STATE HUMAN RESOURCES DIRECTOR

DIRECTOR'S REVIEW PROGRAM
521 Capitol Way South, P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, WA 98504-0911
(360) 664-0388 · FAX (360) 586-4694

April 24, 2012

TO: Brian Earl, President

Graphic Communications Conference

Teamsters Local 767M

FROM: Teresa Parsons, SPHR

Director's Review Program Supervisor

SUBJECT: Jonathan McMillan v. Department of Enterprise Services (DES)

Allocation Review Request ALLO-11-064

On February 23, 2012, I conducted a Director's review conference regarding the allocation of the following positions:

Joshua Faught Position #H0489 Jonathan McMillan Position #H0442 Joel Walker Position #H0487 Wayne Hatfield Position #H0451

In addition to you, Joshua Faught participated in the Director's review conference and provided further clarification about the duties performed by these positions. Wayne Hatfield no longer works in the position. Tony Brown, Human Resources Consultant, and Terry Wilson, Human Resources Manager, represented DES. Kris Brophy, Director's Review Investigator, also participated in the conference.

Background

On October 1, 2011, the former Department of Printing consolidated with other agencies into the newly created DES as a result of Engrossed Substitute Senate Bill 5931. Therefore, the Department of Printing and its classification system ceased to exist on September 30, 2011. As a result, the employees' positions, which had previously been allocated as Press Assistants, were placed into the Washington General Service (WGS) classification system. Because the WGS classification plan does not include the specific job classes previously used by the Department of Printing, DES allocated the employees' positions to an existing WGS job class on a best fit basis. In addition, DES Y-rated the employees' salaries pursuant to Article 40.4 of the Collective Bargaining Agreement between the State of Washington and the Coalition, including Teamsters Local 767M (Exhibit 2).

Director's Determination

Mr. McMillan's position review was based on the Position Description Form (PDF) describing his duties and responsibilities on October 1, 2011 (Exhibit 3). As the Director's designee, I carefully considered all of the documentation in the file and the verbal comments provided by both parties during the Director's review conference. Based on my review and analysis of Mr. McMillan's assigned duties and responsibilities, I conclude the Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 class provides the best fit overall, based on the existing job classes.

Summary of Employee's (Faught, McMillan, Walker, Hatfield) Perspective

The employees assert there is no class in the general government classification system that fully and accurately describes the duties and responsibilities assigned to their positions. Specifically, the employees contend that work assisting journey level press operators on large presses (over 22 inches) exceeds the requirements of the Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 job class. The employees contend the work and level of technical complexity required to operate and maintain these presses extend beyond that of an offset duplicating machine, as identified in the Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 job class. The employees note that each printing press is unique and generally requires a four-year apprenticeship to reach journey level. Further, the employees state their positions do not perform work on bindery equipment, as listed in the class specification. As a result, the employees assert a new job class needs to be created to adequately describe the full scope of printing-related duties.

Summary of DES's Reasoning

DES acknowledges the existing general government job classes may not provide a perfect fit for the unique functions assigned to employees operating equipment in the print shop. However, DES asserts that of the available class specifications within the general government classification system, the employees' positions best fit the Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 classification.

Rationale for Director's Determination

The purpose of a position review is to determine which classification best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of a position. A position review is neither a measurement of the volume of work performed, nor an evaluation of the expertise with which that work is performed. A position review is a comparison of the duties and responsibilities of a particular position to the available classification specifications. This review results in a determination of the class that best describes the overall duties and responsibilities of the position. <u>Liddle-Stamper v. Washington State University</u>, PAB Case No. 3722-A2 (1994).

Duties and Responsibilities

Mr. McMillan works on second shift and serves as a press assistant to a journey level large press operator (working titles) for the Printing Division of DES. He assists the press operator in performing a variety of high volume, high-quality complex printing work for the print shop. Specifically, the position objective on Mr. McMillan's PDF reads as follows (Exhibit 3):

The press assistant assists operators of presses with 4 or more print units and works on the press, making adjustments to the feeder, print units and delivery, monitoring fountain solution, ink and paper, and cleans the press and the areas around the press. This position interprets job tickets and facilitates the production of high quality printing in a professional manner.

These duties comprise the majority of work (75%) assigned to Mr. McMillan's position. In addition, when cleaning the press and areas around the press, Mr. McMillan uses rubber gloves, solvent, brushes, brooms, detergent, vacuums and compressed air. He also interprets job tickets and facilitates the production of high quality printing and uses the Monarch software program to accurately track his work.

During the review conference, Mr. Faught explained the press assistant positions assist the journey level press operators on one of the following machines: Heidelberg press, Komori press, or Muller Martini web press. Mr. McMillan works second shift and primarily assists with the Komori or web press. The Komori is a 20" by 28" six-color inline press with a variety of inks including metallic ink or whole blues and other special color processing for high-quality printing. The web press is capable of running off a large roll in addition to being sheet fed and is capable of eight-color processing on one side of the paper or four-color processing on two sides of the paper. The Heidelberg is a 40" by 28" sheet-fed press capable of printing two-color and four-color processing. The press assistant's job involves setting up each of the individual units. You and Mr. Faught indicated that the large presses more closely resemble offset lithography because the ink from the roller transfers to a plate cylinder, which differs from an offset duplicating machine with one color.

The press assistant's primary job involves working on the feeder end, while the operator works on the finishing end. As such, the press assistant monitors the ink and solutions to ensure the proper levels remain through an entire print job, which can be a large volume of sheets. The press assistant makes adjustments to the double sheet detector to ensure one sheet goes through at a time. Further, feeding and stacking paper involves "throwing the paper" or grabbing an oversized, large stack of paper weighing several pounds and curling it before feeding it into the machine to ensure the paper does not get jammed. Some jobs also require running one side at a time and then turning the paper over and running the other side.

In addition, the press assistant helps maintain and clean all filters of the press to remove all paper dust. This includes maintaining rollers and greasing fittings on a regular basis. You and Mr. Faught indicated the press manufacturer will deal mainly with issues that arise with the electrical functions of the machine; otherwise, the press assistants perform all regular maintenance. In addition, the large press assistants have the ability to back up any of the large press operators on the Heidelberg, Komori, or Muller Martini web press.

Class Specifications

When comparing the assignment of work and level of responsibility to the available class specifications, the class series concept (if one exists) followed by definition and distinguishing characteristics are primary considerations.

The **Printing and Duplication Specialist 2** definition reads as follows (Exhibit 4):

Functions as a fully qualified technician performing journey level technical tasks operating offset duplicating, or bindery machines. Positions work independently and exercise judgment and discretion in determining the scope or level of service. Performs repairs of machinery. Work is typically reviewed on a spot check basis after decisions have been made. Unusual problems that may occur are brought to a higher level technician with probable outcomes and solutions. May supervise and train lower level operators, clerical staff, temporary or resident clerical staff, volunteers, or interns.

I understand the press assistant positions perform a variety of very specialized tasks that are unique to specific types of printing press equipment. I further recognize the technical aspects of these jobs require specialized skills to perform the work. However, based on the job classifications currently available within the general government classification system, the Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 is the job class that most closely aligns with the overall level and scope of duties and responsibilities assigned to the press assistant positions. While Mr. McMillan's position performs work assisting a journey level position, his work exceeds the entry level work described in the **Printing and Duplication Specialist 1** class (Exhibit 5). Mr. McMillan's position functions as a fully qualified technician applying independent judgment to regularly perform tasks, while the press operator maintains general oversight.

Although examples of typical work identified in a class specification do not form the basis for an allocation, they lend support to the work envisioned within a classification. I realize the Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 typical work examples include work not performed by Mr. McMillan's position, such as the work involving bindery equipment. However, while not exact, some of the examples describing work similar to Mr. McMillan's duties include the following:

- Reviews instructions and schedules to determine equipment set-ups . . .;
- Sets up and operates offset duplicating machine to reproduce . . . forms, memoranda, letterheads, manuals, pamphlets, and other materials in one or more colors:
- Cleans machines, checks performance, and makes minor repairs and adjustments

In <u>Salsberry v. Washington State Parks and Recreation Commission</u>, PRB Case No. R-ALLO-06-013 (2007), the Personnel Resources Board addressed the concept of best fit. The Board concurred with the former Personnel Appeals Board's conclusion that while the appellant's duties and responsibilities did not encompass the full breadth of the duties and responsibilities described by the classification to which his position was allocated, on a best fit basis, the classification best described the level, scope and diversity of the overall duties and responsibilities of his position. Allegri v. Washington State University, PAB Case No. ALLO-96-0026 (1998).

It is clear Mr. McMillan and the other press assistants perform skilled work in a professional manner and ensure printing operations run smoothly. A position's allocation is not a reflection of performance or an individual's ability to perform higher level work. Rather, an allocation is based on the majority of work assigned to a position and how that work best aligns with the available job classifications. In this case, based on the available job classes, the Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 job class provides the best overall fit for the duties and responsibilities assigned to his position.

Appeal Rights

RCW 41.06.170 governs the right to appeal. RCW 41.06.170(4) provides, in relevant part, the following:

An employee incumbent in a position at the time of its allocation or reallocation, or the agency utilizing the position, may appeal the allocation or reallocation to . . . the Washington personnel resources board Notice of such appeal must be filed in writing within thirty days of the action from which appeal is taken.

The mailing address for the Personnel Resources Board (PRB) is P.O. Box 40911, Olympia, Washington, 98504-0911. The PRB Office is located at 521 Capitol Way South, Olympia, Washington. The main telephone number is (360) 664-0388, and the fax number is (360) 586-4694.

If no further action is taken, the Director's determination becomes final.

c: Jonathan McMillan Tony Brown, DES Lisa Skriletz, OSHRD

Enclosure: List of Exhibits

Jonathan McMillan v. DES ALLO-11-064

List of Exhibits

- 1. Request for Director's Review Form, received October 14, 2011
- 2. October 1, 2011 reallocation decision letter from DES
- 3. Position Description Form in effect on October 1, 2011
- 4. Printing and Duplication Specialist 2 Class Specification 205F
- 5. Printing and Duplication Specialist 1 Class Specification 205E